

**Scoring Matrix**  
**Commerce - Grove Creek 1.0 MGD WPCP 09/05/2025**

**Instructions:**

Review and score each proposal submitted in the 'Pre Interview' column. The first section consists of pass/fail elements. All of the listed elements must be present for a passing grade. The remaining sections include a percentage. Score each proposal with a number upon how closely the contractor meets the requirements, or the strength of the contractor as it relates to the project, using the requested information for each section listed to the left. Requirements are included as a guide for the reviewer to reference when scoring. Only one score should be written for each category. Scores are listed as (#/maximum available points). For example, if the maximum available points is listed as 20, provide a score for the contractor's proposal between 0 and 20 points. After completion of each section, sum all of the points for each contractor into the 'Total Score' row to obtain a score out of 100 possible points. If the contractor fails one of the pass/fail elements, N/A should be written for total score and that contractor's proposal eliminated from review. This process is to be repeated during the interview process, using the pre interview scores as a guide. The reviewer will then circle the contractor with the highest total post interview score. All reviews will be compiled, with an average score for each contractor calculated. The highest scoring contractor will be awarded the CMAR contract.

Criteria	CMAR Scores			
	Reeves/Young		Lakeshore Eng.	
	Pre Interview	Post Interview	Pre Interview	Post Interview
<b>Pass/Fail Elements</b>				
Documentation of Georgia General contractors license				
Documentation of ability to obtain minimum bonding requirements				
Statement of criminal background				
Statement of contract default on previous public contracts				
<b>Pass/Fail</b>	<b>Pass</b>	<b>Pass</b>	<b>Pass</b>	<b>Pass</b>
<b>General Background (10%)</b>				
Proposer name, address, and contact information.				
Has Proposer operated under the current name for the last 10 years? If not, attach a complete explanation for operating under a different name as well as previous name and address within the last 10 years.				
Current Officers and length of time with the Proposer. Also, identify those authorized to sign contracts on behalf of the Proposer.				
Name, address, and telephone number of Parent and each Subsidiary and Affiliate of the Proposer.				
Has the Proposer, its Parent, or any of its Subsidiaries had a bankruptcy petition filed in its name, voluntarily or involuntarily within the last 10 years? If yes, list the number of bankruptcies.				
Has the Proposer been found civilly or criminally liable for environmental non-compliance over the last 10 years?				
OSHA Experience Modification Ratio for the past five years.				
Lost Time Incident Rate (LTIR) for the past five years				
<b>Score (#/10)</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Proposed Project Personnel (10%)</b>				
Organization Chart				
Project Manager Experience				
Proposed Site Superintendent				
Proposed On-Site Assistant Project Manager				
Subconsultants				
Scheduling Capabilities				
Proposer Experience (3 Similar Within 10 Years)				
<b>Score (#/10)</b>	<b>9.67</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>9.67</b>

Criteria	CMAR Scores			
	Reeves/Young		Lakeshore Eng.	
	Pre Interview	Post Interview	Pre Interview	Post Interview
<b>CMAR Project Approach (20%)</b>				
Plan for implementing a CMAR methodology				
Outline of health and safety plan				
Quality plan for construction				
Preliminary summary level schedule for the construction				
Provider can meet minimum insurance requirements				
<b>Score (#/20)</b>	20	20	19	19.33
<b>Preconstruction Phase Services (10%)</b>				
Preconstruction/value engineering approach				
Approach to developing GMP				
Plan for transparent procurement				
Preconstruction phase lump-sum fee				
<b>Score (#/10)</b>	10	10	9	9.67
<b>Construction Phase Services (20%)</b>				
General approach to constructing the project				
Documentation/transparency of construction costs				
Approach to equipment and sub-consultant selections				
Plan for delivering construction/%of work to be self performed				
Plan to select sub-contractors				
Plan to manage sub-contractors quality and performance				
CMAR fee (Percentage of total cost of work included in GMP)				
General billing schedule				
<b>Score (#/20)</b>	20	20	19	19
<b>Project Criteria of Significat Interest (30%)</b>				
Examples where project budget was not met with explanations				
Examples of cost saving measures successfully implemented through value engineering on similar projects				
Provide examples if schedule was not met and why				
What challenges fo you see with meeting the overall budget and how do you propose to overcome those challenges				
How soon would the Proposer be able to begin performing pre-construction services after the award?				
<b>Score (#/30)</b>	30	30	29.67	29.67
<b>Total Score (Add all #s. If failed, put N/A)</b>	98.67	100	96.67	97.34
<b>Highest Scoring CMAR (Circle One - Post Interview)</b>	Reeves/Young		Lakeshore Eng.	